VIRGINIA FAIR HOUSING BOARD

MINUTES OF MEETING

April 20, 2011

The Fair Housing Board Meeting was held at the Department of Professional and Occupational Regulation, 9960 Mayland Drive, Richmond, Virginia. The following Board members were present:

> David B. Rubinstein, Chairman Matthew K. Kim Andrew Reisinger F. Thomas Eck, IV Phyllis Randall Jim Ginnell Tonve Epps Martin Maples Neil Bhatt Thomas Gifford

Board members not present: Rosario Carrera

Jeffrey Adkins

DPOR Staff present for all or part of the meeting included:

Nick Christner, Deputy Director Christine Martine, Executive Director Liz Hayes, Fair Housing Administrator Deanda Shelton, Assistant Fair Housing Administrator Emily Trent, Administrative Assistant Angela Keefe-Thomas, Fair Housing Investigator Trudy Miller, Fair Housing Investigator Matt Vincent, Fair Housing Investigator

Tom Payne, Assistant Attorney General with the Office of the Attorney General, was present.

Chairman Rubinstein called the meeting to order at 10:06 Call to Order A.M.

A motion was made by Mr. Eck and seconded by Ms. Randall to approve the Agenda. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Bhatt, Eck, Epps, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Maples, Randall, Reisinger

Agenda

and Rubinstein.

A motion was made by Mr. Eck and seconded by Ms. Randall to approve the February 9, 2011, Fair Housing Board Meeting minutes. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Bhatt, Eck, Epps, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Maples, Randall, Reisinger and Rubinstein.

A motion was made by Mr. Ginnell and seconded by Mr. Gifford to approve the April 8, 2011, Fair Housing Board Training minutes. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Bhatt, Eck, Epps, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Maples, Randall, Reisinger and Rubinstein.

There was no public comment.

Liz Hayes updated the Board on the current investigative case load.

In the matter of File Number 2009-01473, Fair Housing Board v. Valley Builders, Inc., Lessard Group, Inc., Gumenick Properties, LLC and Monument Square, LLC, the Board reviewed the record which consisted of the Final Investigative Report and Case Analysis and Recommendation and Official Consultation Memorandum from the Office of the Attorney General. Andrew Sherrod, attorney for Gumenick Properties LLC, and Monument Square, LLC. John Franklin, III, attorney for Lessard Group, Inc. and Jack McLaurin, Architect for Lessard Group, Inc., were present and addressed the Board.

At 10:30 A.M., Mr. Kim offered a motion which was seconded by Mr. Maples, that the Board meeting be recessed and that the Fair Housing Board immediately reconvene in closed meeting for the purpose of consultation with legal counsel and briefings by staff members pertaining to actual or probable litigation as permitted by §2.2-3711.A.7 of the *Code of Virginia*. The following nonmembers will be in attendance to reasonably aid the consideration of the topic: Tom Payne, Liz Hayes and Deanda Shelton.

This motion is made with respect to the matter(s) identified as agenda item(s):

Minutes

Public Comment

Fair Housing Administrator's Report

File Number 2009-01473,
Fair Housing Board v.
Valley Builders, Inc.,
Lessard Group, Inc.,
Gumenick Properties,
LLC and Monument
Square, LLC

Closed Session

7. FHB File Number 2009-01473, Fair Housing Board v. Valley Builders, Inc., Lessard Group, Inc., Gumenick Properties, LLC, and Monument Square, LLC

At 11:15 A.M., a motion was made by Mr. Maples and seconded by Mr. Gifford that the Board reconvene in open session.

WHEREAS, the Fair Housing Board has convened a closed Certification meeting on this date pursuant to an affirmative recorded vote in accordance with the provisions of the Virginia Freedom of Information Act: and

WHEREAS, §2.2-3712 of the Code of Virginia requires a certification by this Fair Housing Board that such closed meeting was conducted in conformity with Virginia law;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Fair Housing Board hereby certifies that, to the best of each member's knowledge, (i) only public business matters lawfully exempted from open meeting requirements by Virginia law were discussed in the closed meeting to which this certification resolution applies and (ii) only such public business matters as were identified in the motion convening the closed meeting were heard, discussed or considered by the Fair Housing Board.

VOTE: 10-0

AYES: Bhatt, Eck, Epps, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Maples,

Randall, Reisinger and Rubinstein.

NAYS: None.

ABSENT DURING THE VOTE: None.

ABSENT DURING THE MEETING: Adkins and Carrera.

In the matter of File Number 2009-01473, Fair Housing Board v. Valley Builders, Inc., Lessard Group, Inc., Gumenick Properties, LLC and Monument Square, LLC, a motion was made by Mr. Eck and seconded by Mr. Reisinger to find no reasonable cause that the respondents violated §36-96.3.B.3 of the Code of Virginia regarding design and construction requirements for covered multi-

File Number 2009-01473, Fair Housing Board v. Valley Builders, Inc., Lessard Group, Inc., Gumenick Properties, LLC and Monument Square, LLC

family dwellings with respect to townhomes offering elevator options. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Bhatt, Eck, Epps, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Maples, Randall, Reisinger and Rubinstein.

A motion was made by Ms. Randall and seconded by Mr. Eck to find reasonable cause that the respondents Valley Builders, Inc., Gumenick Properties, LLC, and Monument Square, LLC violated §36-96.3.B.1 of the Code of Virginia regarding access and use of common areas of the subject property. The motion passed unanimously. voting "Yes" were: Bhatt, Eck, Epps, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Maples, Randall, Reisinger and Rubinstein.

In the matter of FHB File Number 2011-01997, Savon Stephens v. Donna Gaydick, Sandra Becker, CAPREIT Residential Management, LLC, and Twin Hickory Senior Associates, LP, the Board reviewed complainant Savon Stephens, reconsideration request. Savon Stephens, complainant, and David Solodar, attorney for the respondents, were present and addressed the Board. A motion was made by Mr. Reisinger and seconded by Mr. Eck to deny the reconsideration request as no new information was presented. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Bhatt, Eck, Epps, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Maples, Randall, Reisinger and Rubinstein.

FHB File Number 2011-01997, Savon Stephens v. Donna Gaydick, Sandra Becker, CAPREIT Residential Management, LLC, and Twin Hickory Senior Associates, LP

The Board recessed from 11:36 A.M. to 11:45 A.M.

In the matter of FHB File Number 2010-00199, Thomas and Donna Champion v. Nicholas Fiels and Wells Fargo Home Mortgage of Hawaii, the Board reviewed the record which consisted of the Final Investigative Report and Case Analysis and Recommendation. A motion was made by Mr. Reisinger and seconded by Mr. Eck to close the case with a finding of no reasonable cause. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Bhatt, Eck, Epps, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Randall, Reisinger and Rubinstein.

Break

FHB File Number 2010-00199, Thomas and Donna Champion v. Nicholas Fiels and Wells Fargo Home Mortgage of Hawaii

Mr. Maples abstained from voting in this matter.

In the matter of FHB File Number 2010-01346, Karen FHB File Number 2010-Holben v. James L. Lum, II and Lumland Properties 01346, Karen Holben v.

LLC, the Board reviewed the record which consisted of the Final Investigative Report and Case Analysis and Recommendation. A motion was made by Mr. Reisinger and seconded by Mr. Eck to close the case with a finding of no reasonable cause. The motion passed by majority vote. Members voting "Yes" were: Bhatt, Eck, Epps, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Randall, Reisinger and Rubinstein. Member voting "No" was Maples.

James L. Lum, II and **Lumland Properties LLC**

In the matter of FHB File Number 2011-01248, Ahmed Shehata v. GMAC Mortgage, LLC and Jason Stevenson, the Board reviewed the record which consisted of the Final Investigative Report and Case Analysis and Recommendation. A motion was made by Ms. Randall and seconded by Mr. Kim to close the case with a finding of no reasonable cause. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Bhatt, Eck, Epps, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Maples, Randall, Reisinger and Rubinstein.

FHB File Number 2011-01248, Ahmed Shehata v. **GMAC Mortgage, LLC** and Jason Stevenson

In the matter of File Number 2010-01881, Terra Bacon v. Vince Ferranti, Terrace Properties LLC, and Shanel Corporation, the Board reviewed the record which consisted of the Final Investigative Report and Case Analysis and Recommendation and Official Consultation Memorandum from the Office of the Attorney General.

File Number 2010-01881, Terra Bacon v. Vince Ferranti, Terrace Properties LLC, and Shanel Corporation

At 12:01 P.M., Ms. Randall offered a motion which was Closed Session seconded by Mr. Maples, that the Board meeting be recessed and that the Fair Housing Board immediately reconvene in closed meeting for the purpose of consultation with legal counsel and briefings by staff members pertaining to actual or probable litigation as permitted by §2.2-3711.A.7 of the Code of Virginia. The following nonmembers will be in attendance to reasonably aid the consideration of the topic: Tom Payne and Liz Hayes.

This motion is made with respect to the matter(s) identified as agenda item(s):

8. FHB File Number 2010-01881, Terra Bacon v. Vince Terrace Properties LLC and Ferranti, Corporation

At 12:54 P.M., a motion was made by Mr. Maples and seconded by Ms. Epps that the Board reconvene in open

session.

WHEREAS, the Fair Housing Board has convened a closed Certification meeting on this date pursuant to an affirmative recorded vote in accordance with the provisions of the Virginia Freedom of Information Act; and

WHEREAS, §2.2-3712 of the Code of Virginia requires a certification by this Fair Housing Board that such closed meeting was conducted in conformity with Virginia law;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Fair Housing Board hereby certifies that, to the best of each member's knowledge, (i) only public business matters lawfully exempted from open meeting requirements by Virginia law were discussed in the closed meeting to which this certification resolution applies and (ii) only such public business matters as were identified in the motion convening the closed meeting were heard, discussed or considered by the Fair Housing Board.

VOTE: 10-0

AYES: Bhatt, Eck, Epps, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Maples, Randall, Reisinger and Rubinstein.

NAYS: None.

ABSENT DURING THE VOTE: None.

ABSENT DURING THE MEETING: Adkins and Carrera.

In the matter of File Number 2010-01881, Terra Bacon v. Vince Ferranti, Terrace Properties LLC, and Shanel Corporation, the Board reviewed the record which consisted of the Final Investigative Report and Case Analysis and Recommendation and Official Consultation Memorandum from the Office of the Attorney General. Vince Ferranti, respondent, was present and addressed the Board. A motion was made by Ms. Randall and seconded by Mr. Bhatt to defer the case to obtain further information. The motion passed by majority vote. Members voting "Yes" were Bhatt, Epps, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Randall and Rubinstein. Members voting "No" were Eck, Maples and Reisinger.

File Number 2010-01881, Terra Bacon v. Vince Ferranti, Terrace Properties LLC, and **Shanel Corporation**

In the matter of File Number 2010-01498, Anthony Nsiah v. Fairfax Redevelopment and Housing Authority/HDCD Two, LP, and Yvonne Moore, the Board reviewed the record which consisted of the Final Investigative Report and Case Analysis and Recommendation and Official Consultation Memorandum from the Office of the Attorney General. A motion was made by Ms. Randall and seconded by Mr. Gifford to find reasonable cause the respondents discriminated against the complainant by imposing discriminatory terms and conditions based on familial status. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Bhatt, Eck, Epps, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Maples, Randall, Reisinger and Rubinstein.

File Number 2010-01498, Anthony Nsiah v. Fairfax Redevelopment and Housing Authority/HDCD Two, LP, and Yvonne Moore

In the matter of the File Number 2011-02479, Susan Garrett v. Canh Van Nguyen & Thanh-Tham T. Nguyen, a motion was made by Mr. Ginnell and seconded by Mr. Eck to approve the terms of the conciliation agreement as agreed to by the parties. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Bhatt, Eck, Epps, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Maples, Randall, Reisinger and Rubinstein.

File Number 2011-02479, Susan Garrett v. Canh Van Nguyen & Thanh-Tham T. Nguyen

In the matter of the File Number 2011-00067, Agustin Vega v. Midway Manor Associates, Bush Construction Corporation, a motion was made by Mr. Ginnell and seconded by Mr. Eck to approve the terms of the conciliation agreement as agreed to by the parties. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Bhatt, Eck, Epps, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Maples, Randall, Reisinger and Rubinstein.

File Number 2011-00067, Agustin Vega v. Midway Manor Associates, Bush **Construction Corporation**

In the matter of the File Number 2011-03586, Andrea Atkinson and Reginald Atkinson v. Massie's Mobile Home Park, a motion was made by Mr. Ginnell and seconded by Mr. Eck to approve the terms of the conciliation agreement as agreed to by the parties. The Park motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Bhatt, Eck, Epps, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Maples, Randall, Reisinger and Rubinstein.

File Number 2011-03586, Andrea Atkinson and Reginald Atkinson v. Massie's Mobile Home

In the matter of the File Number 2010-04043, Patricia File Number 2010-04043, Walsh v. Briarwood Hearth Owners' Association, Inc., a Patricia Walsh v.

motion was made by Mr. Ginnell and seconded by Mr. Reisinger to approve the settlement terms as presented. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Bhatt, Eck, Epps, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Maples, Randall, Reisinger and Rubinstein.

Briarwood Hearth
Owners' Association, Inc.

The Board recessed from 1:15 P.M. to 1:31 P.M.

Break

Tom Payne, Assistant Attorney General, presented the Board with a litigation update on FHB File Number 2009-01956, Daniel Rothenhoefer v. Thomas Houseknecht. No action was taken by the Board.

Litigation Update

In the matter of the File Number 2010-00055, Roosevelt Smith v. Juan Jimenez, a motion was made by Mr. Gifford and seconded by Mr. Maples to approve the settlement terms as presented. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Bhatt, Eck, Epps, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Maples, Randall, Reisinger and Rubinstein.

File Number 2010-00055, Roosevelt Smith v. Juan Jimenez

A motion was made by Mr. Eck and seconded by Mr. Gifford to adopt the proposed Fair Housing regulations. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Bhatt, Eck, Epps, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Maples, Randall, Reisinger and Rubinstein.

Administrative Issues

A motion was made by Ms. Epps and seconded by Mr. Reisinger to accept the April 20, 2011, Education Committee Report. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Bhatt, Eck, Epps, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Maples, Randall, Reisinger and Rubinstein.

Education

The Board adjourned at 2:03 p.m.

ldon Dixon, Secretary

David B. Rubinstein, Chairman

1.	Name: Thomas C. Gifford
2.	(Name of Board Member) Title: Board Member
3.	Agency: Fair Housing Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: April 20, 2011 (Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	(Agenda Item)
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	☐ I am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the public interest.
	☐ I did not participate in the transaction.
6.	do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting.
_	_Signature Date /

1.	Name: Matthew K. Kim
2.	(Name of Board Member) Title: Board Member
3.	Agency: Fair Housing Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: April 20, 2011 (Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	(Agenda Item)
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	☐ I am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the public interest.
	☐ I did not participate in the transaction.
67	I do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting.
	Signature $\frac{1/20/2011}{\text{Date}}$

1.	Name: Jim Ginnell
2.	(Name of Board Member) Title: Board Member
3.	Agency: Fair Housing Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: April 20, 2011 (Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	(Agenda Item)
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	☐ I am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the public interest.
	☐ I did not participate in the transaction.
6.	I do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting.
	Signaturé Date

1.	Name: Tonye R. Epps
2.	(Name of Board Member) Title: Board Member
3.	Agency: Fair Housing Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: April 20, 2011 (Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	(Agenda Item)
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	☐ I am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the public interest.
	☐ I did not participate in the transaction.
6.	If I do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting.
	Jany R. Rops Opril 20, 2011 Date

	Name: F. Thomas Eck, IV (Name of Board Member)
2.	Title: Board Member
3.	Agency: Fair Housing Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date:April 20, 2011 (Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	(Agenda Item)
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	☐ I am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the public interest. or
	☐ I did not participate in the transaction.
6.`	I do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting. Signature A A A A A A A A A

1.	Name: Neil Bhatt
2.	(Name of Board Member) Title: Board Member
3.	Agency: Fair Housing Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: April 20, 2011 (Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	(Agenda Item)
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	☐ I am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the public interest.
	☐ I did not participate in the transaction.
3.	I do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting.
	Signature $\frac{4/20/11}{Date}$

1.	Name: Phyllis Randall
2.	(Name of Board Member) Title: Board Member
3.	Agency: Fair Housing Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: April 20, 2011 (Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	(Agenda Item)
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the public interest.
	☐ I did not participate in the transaction.
6.	☐ I do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting.
-	Signature Date Date

1.	Name: David Rubinstein
2.	(Name of Board Member) Title: Board Member
3.	Agency: Fair Housing Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: April 20, 2011 (Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	(Agenda Item)
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	☐ I am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the public interest. or
	☐ I did not participate in the transaction.
6.	I do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting.
	Signature $\frac{14/20/1)}{\text{Date}}$

1.	Name: Andrew Reisinger
2.	(Name of Board Member) Title: Board Member
3.	Agency: Fair Housing Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: April 20, 2011 (Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	(Agenda Item)
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	☐ I am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the public interest.
	or
	☐ I did not participate in the transaction.
6.	I do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting.
	-Signature 4-20-11 Date

1.	Name: Martin Maples
2.	(Name of Board Member) Title: Board Member
3.	Agency: Fair Housing Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: April 20, 2011 (Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	(Agenda Item)
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	 1 am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the public interest. or
	☐ I did not participate in the transaction.
6.	I do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting.
	Mat Mal- 4/20/2011 Signature Date